

## Integration of Aswaja Values for Intolerance Prevention in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: A Study of Curriculum and Teachers' Pedagogical Practices

Abdul Karim<sup>1\*</sup>, Moh. Dasuki<sup>2</sup>, and Zainal Abidin<sup>3</sup>, Muhammad Kashif Majeed<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>International Islamic University, Malaysia

\* Corresponding author: [abdulkarim@uinkhas.ac.id](mailto:abdulkarim@uinkhas.ac.id)

Received: 03 December 2025

Accepted: 04 January 2026

Revised: 28 December 2025

Available online: 12 Juni 2026

**To cite this article:** Karim, A., Dasuku, M., Abidin, Z., & Majeed, M.K., (2026). Integration of Aswaja Values for Intolerance Prevention in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: A Study of Curriculum and Teachers' Pedagogical Practices. *Bidayatuna Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 9(1), 47–64.

### Abstract

The phenomenon of intolerance and hate speech in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (Islamic elementary schools) is precipitated by a deficiency in understanding of diversity, an exclusionary environment, and the deleterious influence of social media. The present study aims to analyze the integration of religious moderation values into the Aswaja (*Ahlussunnah wal Jama'ah*) curriculum, teachers' strategies for instilling moderation, and the impact on developing students' inclusive and reflective attitudes. A qualitative approach, employing a case study design, was utilized in this study. The data were collected through observation and interviews, analyzed using the Miles-Huberman-Saldana model, and validated through triangulation and member checks. The findings reveal that: The Aswaja curriculum has been found to comprehensively integrate the principles of *tawassuth* (moderation), *tasamuh* (tolerance), *ittidal* (balance), and *ukhuwah* (brotherhood) into its content, objectives, and learning practices with the aim of preventing intolerance. Teachers' strategies for instilling moderation are implemented through curricular activities, such as discussions of Aswaja values, social reflection, and real-life connections. Co-curricular activities include reflective videos, simulations, and case studies. Extracurricular activities, such as joint ceremonies and IPPNu activities, round out the implementation of this strategy. The findings of this study demonstrate that Aswaja learning fosters social inclusiveness, reduces negative behaviors, develops reflective-empathic attitudes, and internalizes moderation values in students' daily lives. The study's findings indicate that the Aswaja curriculum plays a pivotal role in fostering intolerance prevention by integrating moderation values, multidimensional strategies, and the cultivation of inclusive attitudes. The efficacy of this curriculum is contingent upon the pedagogical competence of the teachers, the effectiveness of role modeling, and the implementation of reflective approaches. The present study makes a significant contribution to the field of social constructivism and transformative learning theories by offering an integrative model of curricular, co-curricular, and extracurricular learning. This model is designed to instill religious moderation, tolerance, and inclusive attitudes.

**Keywords:** Integration of Aswaja Values; Curriculum; Teacher Pedagogy; Prevention of Intolerance.

## 1. Introduction

In elementary school settings, the phenomenon of hate speech and intolerance has become increasingly alarming. This phenomenon is precipitated by students' inadequate comprehension of the significance of diversity (Rahmadini et al., 2024), learning methodologies that are inadequately reflective and inclusive (Barnard, 2023), the impact of family environments that exhibit a lack of tolerance (Firmansyah et al., 2024; Juhri, 2024), and exposure to negative social media content (Mawarti, 2018). Empirical evidence indicates that students tend to reject student council leaders from different religious backgrounds (Suryowati, 2017), while the Setara Institute (2023) reported that 51.6% of senior high school students were willing to elect only student council leaders who shared the same religion. Discriminatory practices have also emerged in the form of coercion to wear religious symbols (Setiawan, 2022) and prohibitions against wearing the hijab (Kapisa, 2019). This phenomenon is further substantiated by the findings of INFID (2021), which reported that 40% of young people expressed agreement with dress regulations based on the religion of the majority. In this context, Islamic elementary schools (Madrasah Ibtidaiyah) have a strategic responsibility to instill the values of religious moderation (Sudirman et al., 2023; Deppalanna et al., 2024; Fahmi, 2025). Consequently, this study is significant in analyzing the implementation of the Aswaja curriculum as a preventive strategy against intolerance within madrasah environments.

A substantial body of research has previously examined the phenomenon of religious moderation and Aswaja within educational institutions. These studies can be broadly categorized into three distinct streams of inquiry. The initial stream of research indicates that Islamic Religious Education (PAI) and Aswaja curricula are meticulously designed to inculcate tolerance, promote interreligious dialogue, and selectively impede hate speech (Suprpto, 2020; Lutfiyani & Ashoumi, 2022). The second stream of research emphasizes that religious study sessions, teacher role modeling, external training, and collaboration between teachers and parents contribute to the regular formation of students' moderate attitudes (Hadirman, 2024; Husna et al., 2023). The third stream of research emphasizes the necessity of adapting the implementation of religious moderation to local characteristics and children's developmental stages, while also addressing challenges related to value integration (Minanda, 2024; Melisa et al., 2025). Consequently, while numerous studies have addressed the implementation of religious moderation in schools, research on the integration of Aswaja values into the curriculum, multidimensional learning strategies, and their impact on preventing intolerance and fostering students' inclusive character remains limited.

The present study aims to analyze the integration of religious moderation values into the Aswaja curriculum, the strategies employed by teachers to cultivate moderation, and the impact of these strategies on the formation of students' inclusive and reflective attitudes. The following research questions have been formulated to guide the investigation: The following inquiry is posited: First, how are the values of *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah* integrated into the content, objectives, and learning practices of Aswaja? The following inquiry is posited: Through what means do educators implement the practice of moderation? To elaborate, the inquiry further delineates that the implementation of moderation may be achieved through three distinct approaches: curricular, co-curricular, and extracurricular. (3) What are the impacts of learning on students' inclusive social attitudes, the reduction of negative behavior, and the internalization of moderation values? Theoretically, this study contributes to enriching social constructivist theory and transformative learning by providing empirical evidence of the internalization of moderation values in Islamic elementary schools (Madrasah Ibtidaiyah). In practice, it presents a model for integrating three domains of learning for educators and strategic guidance for madrasahs in preventing intolerance from the level of basic education.

The present study is predicated on the argument that the prevention of intolerance at the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level cannot be achieved merely through the transmission of religious knowledge. Rather, it requires the systematic integration of moderation values into the curriculum, pedagogical practices, and students' social experiences. The Aswaja curriculum is a pedagogical apparatus that fosters character formation by integrating the values of *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah* into its learning objectives, instructional materials, and activities. The efficacy of this curriculum is bolstered by educators' methodologies that integrate curricular, co-curricular, and extracurricular approaches, thereby ensuring that moderation values do not remain at the conceptual level but become experiential, reflective, and contextualized. The impact of this initiative is evident in several domains. Firstly, it has enhanced social inclusiveness. Secondly, it has promoted the development of empathy. Thirdly, it has led to a reduction in negative behavior. Finally, it has fostered students' ability to manage differences constructively. Consequently, Aswaja learning functions as an efficacious preventative mechanism for cultivating a culture of tolerance and social harmony from an early age.

## 2. Method

This study employed a qualitative approach to explore the issue of religious moderation through the implementation of the Aswaja curriculum as a preventive strategy against hate speech and intolerance at the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level. The qualitative approach was selected because, as Diehl et al. (2021) explain, it enables an in-depth understanding of the social and cultural contexts of education. The present study adopted a case study design, a method that Crowe et al. (2011) and Coombs (2022) consider effective for examining real-life practices in the implementation of religious values. The case study design was selected for its ability to facilitate a profound contextual comprehension (Hyett et al., 2014; Rashid et al., 2019), rendering it eminently suitable for addressing the research foci, which encompass: The integration of moderation values, such as *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah*, into the Aswaja curriculum is the first component of this study. The second component is an examination of teachers' instructional strategies for instilling these values. The third component is an analysis of the impact of learning on students' attitudes toward diversity and potential conflict.

The research was conducted at MIMA 30 Bustanul Ulum Ambulu, Jember, which was selected because its curriculum explicitly includes Aswaja as a subject and demonstrates a strong commitment to strengthening the values of diversity. According to Manandhar and Joshi (2020), the selection of a research site that exhibits authentic socio-religious value practices is imperative for the acquisition of contextual data. In contrast, Taquette et al. (2022) underscore the significance of opting for institutions that proactively foster tolerance. The research subjects included the head of the madrasah, the vice principal for curriculum affairs, Islamic Religious Education teachers, Aswaja teachers, and students.

. Charamut et al. (2022) posit that the utilization of multiple informants fosters a comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon, while Kyololo et al. (2023) emphasize the significance of student participation in assessing the impact of value-based education on social behavior within the context of diversity and tolerance.

The data were collected through observation and semi-structured interviews. Direct observation at the madrasah was conducted to examine the implementation of the Aswaja curriculum, as well as teacher–student interactions. As posited by Busetto et al. (2020), contextual observation assumes particular significance within the ambit of qualitative studies, given its capacity to unveil dynamics that may elude discernment through conventional interview methods. Conversely, semi-structured interviews were selected based on the

recommendation of McIntosh and Morse (2015), as they offer flexibility in capturing the dynamics of informants' responses. Gunawan et al. (2022) posit that interviews are a significant technique for comprehending participants' subjective experiences. This methodological triangulation approach, as proposed by Sutton and Austin (2015), was employed to facilitate students' direct involvement in assessing the internalization of religious moderation values (Mtisi, 2022).

The data analysis in this study adopted the Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña model, which consists of three stages: data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. Ridder (2014) posits that this model is highly effective for analyzing qualitative data because it enables researchers to systematically filter and organize information. Naeem et al. (2023) further emphasize that this approach provides a robust framework for constructing research narratives based on field evidence. The analysis process was conducted concurrently with data collection, as recommended by Yu et al. (2014), thereby enabling the immediate examination and validation of preliminary findings in the field.

In order to ensure the validity of the data, this study employed a combination of source and methodological triangulation. Carter et al. (2014) posit that triangulation plays an instrumental role in enhancing the credibility of qualitative research findings. Source triangulation was conducted by comparing information obtained from various informants, while methodological triangulation was carried out by comparing the results of observations and interviews (Natow, 2019). Furthermore, the researchers implemented member checking as a method to corroborate the interview results with the informants. This approach aligns with the tenets established by Erdmann and Potthoff (2023), who emphasize the significance of member checking in ensuring the congruence between the researchers' interpretations and the informants' perspectives. Ahmed (2024) underscores the pivotal role of validation techniques in ensuring the accuracy and credibility of qualitative research. The application of these techniques must be consistent and reflective to ensure the integrity of the research process.

### 3. Results

#### 3.1. Religious Moderation Values in the Aswaja Curriculum at Islamic Elementary Schools

The incorporation of religious moderation values into Aswaja learning functions as a strategic response to the rising incidence of hate speech and intolerance in elementary education. The Aswaja curriculum has been meticulously designed to serve as a medium for the internalization of the values of *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, and *ukhuwah* among students from an early age. The curriculum, instructional objectives, and teaching materials have been meticulously designed to cultivate students' character, instilling in them the capacity to resist extremist ideologies and foster harmonious social relations that celebrate diversity.

**Table 1. Moderation Values in the Aswaja Curriculum**

| Informant | Analytical Theme                        | Statement                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Thematic Explanation                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-----------|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| EF        | Moderation values in curriculum content | The Aswaja learning materials contain the values of <i>tawassuth</i> , <i>tasamuh</i> , <i>i'tidal</i> , and <i>ukhuwah</i> , with particular emphasis on <i>tawassuth</i> , <i>tasamuh</i> , and <i>ukhuwah</i> . | The materials explicitly teach moderation values. The focus on these three main values is intended to shape students' moderate and tolerant attitudes and foster a sense of brotherhood in their daily lives. |
| MF        | Moderation-oriented                     | The objectives of Aswaja learning are to shape students' character so that                                                                                                                                         | Learning is directed toward the internalization of moderation values as a safeguard against extremism and as a                                                                                                |

|    |                                                      |                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|----|------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    | learning objectives                                  | they possess noble morals, demonstrate tolerance, and avoid extremist behavior.                                                       | means of strengthening students' character.                                                                                                                                           |
| MY | Prevention of hate speech through teaching materials | The teaching materials include examples of behaviors that should be avoided, such as insulting different groups and spreading hatred. | The curriculum serves a preventive function by establishing behavioral boundaries, thereby enabling students to develop awareness of respecting differences and avoiding hate speech. |
| SM | Contextual learning practices of moderation values   | Teachers emphasize moderate and tolerant attitudes through stories of NU figures and examples from everyday life.                     | Contextual and exemplary approaches make moderation values easier for students to understand, more grounded, and more applicable in their daily lives.                                |

Source: Processed by the researchers, 2026.

As illustrated in Table 1, the Aswaja curriculum incorporates the tenets of tawassuth, tasamuh, and ukhuwah, underscoring a balanced and inclusive approach to religious education. The learning objectives are oriented toward shaping students' character so that they possess noble morals, demonstrate tolerance, and avoid extremist behavior. Moreover, the teaching materials fulfill a preventative function by incorporating prohibitions against insulting different groups and propagating hatred (MY). The learning practices are contextualized through the use of narratives featuring notable figures from the NU community and examples drawn from everyday life. Consequently, this curriculum is designed to transfer knowledge and cultivate moderate awareness, tolerance, and brotherhood as safeguards against extremism and hate speech



Figure 1. Overview of Aswaja and NU-Related Learning Content

Observations, interviews, and Figure 1 demonstrate that religious moderation values are systematically integrated into the Aswaja curriculum to counter intolerance in elementary

education. The integration is evident in learning content emphasizing tawassuth, tasamuh, i'tidal, and ukhuwah as foundational principles for moderate, tolerant, and fraternal attitudes. The learning objectives are centered on the internalization of noble character and the affirmation of anti-extremist attitudes, thereby rendering the curriculum a preventative measure. The teaching materials employed in this context elucidate behaviors to be avoided, including the expression of disparaging remarks regarding differences and the propagation of animosity. Teachers employ a contextual approach, utilizing narratives of NU figures and their relevance to daily life. The Aswaja curriculum is characterized by its integrative nature, encompassing the cognitive, affective, and practical dimensions. Consequently, it is not merely normative but applicable in shaping students who are moderate, inclusive, and harmonious in social life.

### 3.2. Teachers' Strategies for Instilling Religious Moderation in Students

The role of educators in instilling and fostering religious moderation values is of paramount importance. Aswaja learning is designed to promote mastery of academic content and to cultivate an inclusive and balanced character. Teachers employ a variety of pedagogical strategies, including contextual lectures, value-based discussions, social reflection, and role modeling. These strategies have been shown to facilitate students' comprehension of tawassuth and tasamuh, while concurrently cultivating social sensitivity, establishing a secure environment for discourse, and aligning learning materials with the intricacies of diversity and hate speech.

**Table 2. Teachers' Strategies for Instilling Religious Moderation**

| Informant | Finding                                         | Statement                                                                                                                                                      | Description                                                                                                                                                                             |
|-----------|-------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| MF        | Variation in Learning Methods                   | Teachers use contextual lectures, value-based discussions, role modeling, and social reflection.                                                               | The learning strategy is not limited to a single method. The combination of active and reflective methods helps students understand and internalize moderation values more effectively. |
| MBS       | Open Dialogue Space                             | Teachers provide space for discussion, particularly when addressing cases of intolerance, so that students can relate Aswaja values to real social conditions. | Open dialogue enables sensitive issues to be explored safely while fostering critical thinking and the internalization of tolerance values.                                             |
| MY        | Teachers as Conflict Mediators                  | In student conflicts, teachers actively act as mediators and provide guidance based on moderation values.                                                      | The mediator role positions teachers as concrete models of moderation in practice; conflict is used as a medium for contextual learning.                                                |
| SM        | Linking Learning Materials to Contextual Issues | Teachers connect Aswaja learning with issues of nationalism, social media use, and students' daily behavior.                                                   | The contextual approach makes moderation values more relevant and less abstract in students' lives.                                                                                     |
| EF        | Social Reflection in Learning                   | Teachers conduct social reflection sessions to help students distinguish constructive criticism from hate speech through case studies and simulations.         | Reflection and simulation train students' practical ability to distinguish moderate from extreme behavior and strengthen their resilience against hate speech.                          |

Source: Processed by the researchers, 2026.

As illustrated in Table 2, Aswaja moderation learning practices are characterized by their diversity and contextual nature. Pedagogues employ a multifaceted approach, integrating lectures, value-based discussions, role modeling, and social reflection to nurture students' comprehension. The utilization of open dialogue is instrumental in fostering a constructive discourse, addressing issues of intolerance, and elucidating the correlation between Aswaja values and prevailing social realities. This approach is pivotal in cultivating critical thinking skills, thereby facilitating a nuanced understanding of these complex subjects. In instances of conflict, teachers assume the role of mediators. Social reflection through case studies and simulations has been demonstrated to facilitate students' ability to distinguish between moderate and extreme behavior. The reinforcement of nationalistic values is facilitated by means of participatory activities. For instance, a student extended an invitation to his peers to raise the flag during the Independence Day commemoration. Collective activities, such as ceremonies involving NU autonomous bodies and the Tutul Pencak Silat Association, serve as practical spaces for cultivating patriotism, unity, and respect for the nation's struggle.



**Figure 2. Integration of Aswaja Values and Nationalism**

Figure 2 illustrates that teachers' strategies for instilling religious moderation encompass five integrated approaches that are holistic, participatory, and preventive. These approaches include the utilization of varied learning methods, such as lectures, discussions, role modeling, and social reflection. Additionally, the provision of open dialogue spaces to connect Aswaja values with social realities, including issues of intolerance, is crucial. Teachers' roles as mediators in student conflicts are also pivotal. Furthermore, the linkage of learning materials to contextual issues, such as nationalism, social media, and everyday life, is essential. Reinforcement through social reflection based on case studies and simulations to distinguish constructive criticism from hate speech is also vital. From an analytical perspective, the integration of intracurricular learning and co-curricular activities suggests a multifaceted approach to the internalization of religious moderation. This integration is intertwined with the strengthening of nationalistic values, indicating a complex and nuanced relationship between these concepts. Therefore, pedagogical approaches employed by educators are not exclusively cognitive or instructional in nature; they are also affective and practical, contributing to the development of students who exhibit moderate, inclusive, and unwavering dedication to national values.

### 3.3. The Impact of Changes in Students' Attitudes toward Diversity

Changes in students' attitudes toward diversity serve as a key indicator for evaluating the effectiveness of religious moderation education through the Aswaja curriculum. An analysis of empirical data, derived from both observational studies and interviews, reveals a positive correlation between sustained learning and an enhancement in students' attitudes. Students

have initiated interactions with individuals from diverse backgrounds, demonstrating a shift away from deleterious behaviors such as mockery or confrontation. Teachers assume a pivotal role in this regard, serving as mentors who guide students in comprehending the values of tolerance, empathy, and peaceful social relations..

**Table 3. The Impact of Changes in Students' Attitudes toward Diversity**

| Informant | Analytical Theme                                   | Core Statement                                                                                                                                                                             | Thematic Explanation                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| MF        | Increased Social Inclusiveness                     | Students showed greater openness in interacting with peers from different backgrounds, such as engaging in discussions, greeting one another, and working together without discrimination. | Aswaja learning encouraged students to reduce discriminatory attitudes. This was reflected in cooperative and friendly behavior across different backgrounds, indicating the internalization of <i>tasamuh</i> values. |
| SM        | Reduction in Negative Behavior                     | There was a decrease in harsh, mocking, and exclusive behavior; students began to show empathy and greater respect for differences in daily communication.                                 | This change indicates the effectiveness of the curriculum in reducing bullying and exclusivism. Empathy became the foundation for creating a moderate and inclusive classroom climate.                                 |
| MY        | Development of Reflective and Empathetic Attitudes | Students became more careful in judging others, were able to listen, accept criticism, and apologize when misunderstandings occurred.                                                      | Reflective attitudes indicate social maturity. Students were not only passively tolerant but also actively improved interpersonal relationships through self-awareness and empathy.                                    |
| MBS       | Internalization of Aswaja Moderation Values        | Students understood the importance of remaining calm, maintaining good relationships, avoiding emotional reactions, and relating Aswaja lessons to real-life situations.                   | Moderation values had become a mindset that guided students' behavior in dealing with conflict and everyday social dynamics.                                                                                           |

Source: Processed by the researchers, 2026.

As illustrated in Table 3, Aswaja learning exerts a substantial influence on the evolution of students' social attitudes. This phenomenon is exemplified by the enhancement of social inclusiveness, manifesting as an increase in students' receptivity to engage with peers from diverse backgrounds through cooperative and non-discriminatory behaviors. Moreover, negative behaviors such as harshness, mockery, and exclusivism exhibited a decline, being superseded by empathy and respect for differences. Furthermore, students exhibited the development of reflective and empathetic attitudes, as evidenced by their capacity to listen, accept criticism, and enhance relationships through self-awareness. Moreover, Aswaja moderation values were not only comprehended cognitively but had also been assimilated as a mindset that guides students' conduct in dealing with conflict and everyday social dynamics in a more composed, discerning, and adaptive manner.



**Figure 2. Students' Attitudes toward Diversity in Madrasah Activities**

Figure 2 demonstrates that Aswaja learning exerts a positive influence on alterations in students' behavior across four domains: increased social inclusiveness, reduced negative behavior, the development of reflective and empathetic attitudes, and the internalization of moderation values. It has been demonstrated that students exhibit an increased propensity to engage with peers from diverse backgrounds. This increased openness is evidenced by a notable enhancement in the quality of interactions, which are characterized by a sense of camaraderie and mutual respect. It has been observed that behaviors characterized by severity, mockery, and exclusivity undergo a gradual decline. Reflective attitudes are evident in students' ability to listen, accept criticism, and apologize, as illustrated in *halal bihalal* activities, where students shake hands with teachers as an expression of mutual forgiveness. The Aswaja moderation values have been demonstrated to shape students' character, fostering qualities such as tolerance, composure, and the capacity for maintaining harmonious social relationships.

#### 4. Discussion

The present study found that the values embedded in the Aswaja curriculum play an important role in preventing intolerance at the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level. First, the Aswaja curriculum, which is designed to inculcate religious moderation values, integrates *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah* into its learning content, objectives, and practices with the aim of preventing intolerance. Second, the implementation of teachers' strategies for instilling religious moderation is evident in curricular activities, including discussions on Aswaja values, social reflection, and connections with everyday life; co-curricular activities, such as reflective videos, simulations, and case studies; and extracurricular activities, such as joint ceremonies and IPPNU activities. Thirdly, Aswaja learning has been demonstrated to foster students' social inclusiveness, curtail negative behavior, cultivate reflective and empathetic attitudes, and internalize moderation values in students' daily lives. Consequently, Aswaja values assume a pivotal role in the prevention of intolerance by means of the integration of moderation values, the enhancement of pedagogical practices among educators, and the cultivation of students' inclusive and reflective character.

These findings are highly relevant to current social conditions, in which the spread of hate speech and symptoms of intolerance has reached the level of elementary education. As Buchori et al. (2021) emphasize, the implementation of religious moderation education in madrasahs holds the potential to cultivate open attitudes and foster peaceful coexistence within plural societies. Husna and Thohir's (2020) critique emphasizes the limitations of purely textual approaches and underscores the necessity of enhancing moderation practices in real-life contexts. In a similar vein, Darling-Hammond et al. (2019) posit that elementary education serves as an initial bulwark against hate speech and intolerance. In this context, the Aswaja

curriculum at MIMA 30 functions as a strategic response to the challenges posed by radicalism and discrimination in both digital and physical spaces. As Rahman and Mulyana (2024) emphasize, a curriculum that targets both cognitive and affective domains possesses considerable transformative potential in shaping students' religious perspectives.

From a theoretical standpoint, these findings serve to reinforce Vygotsky's social constructivist theory, as interpreted by Mcleod (2025). This theory posits that verbal and collaborative interaction plays a pivotal role in the development of value awareness and social norms. The value-based discussions implemented by teachers have been shown to engender dialogic spaces in which students learn to express opinions, listen empathetically, and appreciate differences (Fitriani et al., 2021; Intyaswati et al., 2021). Furthermore, the shift in students' behavior from exclusivity to inclusivity aligns with Mezirow's transformative learning theory, as elaborated in Southworth (2022). According to this theory, critical reflection on experience leads to a transformation in individuals' perspectives. Teachers' moderate role modeling is consistent with Ki Hajar Dewantara's educational philosophy, as explained by Basuni et al. (2021), particularly the principle of *ing ngarso sung tulodo*, which emphasizes that educators should provide real examples rather than merely deliver verbal instruction. Therefore, the internalization of moderation values is not solely achieved through cognitive-instructional processes; affective and practical experiences also play a significant role in this process.

This study posits that the successful internalization of moderation values is largely determined by the role of teachers as key actors who not only impart knowledge but also provide guidance and serve as role models. Turner et al. (2024) emphasize that character education is more effective when delivered through concrete examples rather than verbal instruction. Ben-Amram and Davidovitch (2024) emphasize the pivotal role of teachers as mentors, guiding students through role modeling, empathy, and dialogue. At MIMA 30, Aswaja teachers assume multiple roles, functioning as dialogue facilitators, conflict mediators, and initiators of profound value reflection (Anam et al., 2024). Nevertheless, the paucity of professional development opportunities for teachers in the realm of contextual methods constitutes a substantial impediment. Brandisauskiene et al. (2023) present a cogent argument that the curriculum's full potential is challenging to actualize in the absence of continuous pedagogical capacity development. Consequently, the development of active, reflective, and transformative learning should be prioritized so that the curriculum can genuinely shape an inclusive and tolerant generation.

The findings of this study are consistent with those of Mahrus and Afandi (2024) and Aflahah et al. (2023), who found that the Aswaja curriculum represents a concrete form of contextual learning that fosters students' religious awareness. However, the present study extends the findings of Apriliana et al. (2023) and Muhammad et al. (2023) by specifically demonstrating the integration of the values of *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah* across three domains: curriculum, pedagogy, and extracurricular activities. In contrast to the findings of Hermawan and Arifin (2021), who conceptualize the Aswaja curriculum as a preventative foundation against extremism, this study contributes empirical evidence of tangible behavioral modifications among students, including a decline in mocking behavior and an increase in empathy. Furthermore, these findings contribute to the existing body of knowledge in the field by providing a more comprehensive understanding of how social reflection and value-based discussions effectively assist students in discerning constructive criticism from hate speech (Matamoros-Fernández & Farkas, 2021).

In light of these findings, a series of concrete actions are proposed. First, it is imperative that madrasahs devise continuous training programs for Aswaja teachers to enhance their pedagogical competence in reflective and contextual learning methods. Such programs should

include case studies on intolerance and conflict mediation simulations. Secondly, the development of teaching materials should be enriched with more contextual examples from students' daily lives, including issues related to social media and nationalism. Thirdly, educational institutions should prioritize the augmentation of extracurricular activities, including interclass value-discussion forums and collaborative endeavors involving students from diverse backgrounds. Fourthly, it is imperative for education authorities to implement policies that facilitate the integration of religious moderation into Aswaja subjects, as well as across all curricular areas. Fifthly, it is imperative to implement systematic, recurrent assessments that employ valid instruments to evaluate the long-term efficacy of the program.

## 5. Conclusions

The Aswaja curriculum in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah functions as a system for preventing intolerance—rather than merely transmitting teachings—through three pillars: the integration of the values of *tawassuth*, *tasamuh*, *i'tidal*, and *ukhuwah* into the instructional material; teacher strategies through curricular, co-curricular, and extracurricular channels; and tangible outcomes in the form of increased social inclusivity and a decrease in negative student behavior. However, the efficacy of this approach hinges on the pedagogical competence of the instructors. Absent concrete role modeling and a reflective approach, the values of moderation risk becoming mere moral rote learning. The central finding of this study indicates that the internalization of moderation necessitates a dialogic and contextual learning ecosystem, rather than a mere transmission of doctrine. Theoretically, these findings reinforce social constructivism (i.e., the notion that individuals create their own realities through interaction with others) by highlighting the importance of verbal and collaborative interactions in discussions of Aswaja values, which foster an awareness of tolerance starting in elementary school. They also enrich transformative learning theory (i.e., the idea that learning occurs when individuals critically reflect on real-world social experiences, rather than merely receiving instruction) by emphasizing the role of real-world social experiences in fostering a shift from exclusive to inclusive attitudes. Furthermore, these findings offer a practical model for integrating the three domains of learning through simulations, case studies, and the exemplary role of local figures. The model also provides guidance for madrasahs in designing reflective activities, such as discussions on cases of intolerance and cross-group social projects.

The present study is subject to three limitations. Firstly, it was conducted at a single madrasah, precluding the possibility of generalizing its findings to other sociocultural contexts. Secondly, the data collected are limited to processes and experiences during a specific period, thus failing to measure the long-term impact of the internalization of moderation values. Thirdly, the study's focus is constrained to the teacher-student perspective, neglecting to explore the roles of parents and the broader community. Consequently, further research is recommended to include various types of schools and regions, employ a longitudinal approach, and engage families and the community to enhance the efficacy of religious moderation education.

## 6. CRediT Authorship Contribution Statement

**Abdul Karim:** Conceptualization, Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Investigation, Methodology, Project administration, Resources, Writing Original Draft, and Writing Review & Editing. **Moh. Dasuki:** Conceptualization, Formal Analysis, Methodology, and Writing Review & Editing. **Zainal Abidin:** Formal Analysis, Supervision, Validation, Visualization. **Muhammad Kashif Majeed:** Formal Analysis, Validation, Writing Review & Editing.

## 7. Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

## 8. Acknowledgments

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to the Principal and teachers of MIMA 30 Bustanul Ulum Ambulu, Jember, for their valuable participation as research informants in this study. Their contributions, cooperation, and support were instrumental in the successful completion of this research and the preparation of this article.

## 9. Data Availability

Data will be made available on request.

## 10. Funding

## 11. Ethical Approval

Ethical approval No patient-identifying parts in this paper were used or known to the authors. Therefore, no ethical approval was requested.

## 12. References

- Aflahah, S., Nisa, K., & Aldeia, A. (2023). The Role of Education in Strengthening Religious Moderation in Indonesia. *Jurnal SMART (Studi Masyarakat, Religi, dan Tradisi)*, 9(2), 193–211. <https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v9i2.2079>
- Ahmed, S. K. (2024). The Pillars Of Trustworthiness In Qualitative Research. *Journal of Medicine, Surgery, and Public Health*, 2, 100051. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.glmedi.2024.100051>
- Amanulloh, M. J. A., Rochmawati, R., Rochmah, L. M., & Muzakky, M. I. (2024). Aswaja An-Nahdliyyah Module Innovation Based On Competitive Learning. *Nusantara: Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia*, 4(4), 1068–1084. <https://doi.org/10.14421/njpi.2024.v4i4-13>
- Anam, N., Degeng, I. N. S., Kuswandi, D., & Sulton. (2024). Cycle Model Of Integrative-Interconnective Strategy within Character Learning. *JTP - Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 26(1), 218–241. <https://doi.org/10.21009/jtp.v26i1.44494>
- Apriliana, E., Junaedi, M., & Ikhrom, I. (2023). Islamic Religious Education And The Global Ethics: Opportunities And Challenges Towards Peace Education In Indonesia. *LISAN AL-HAL: Jurnal Pengembangan Pemikiran Dan Kebudayaan*, 17(1), 83–97. <https://doi.org/10.35316/lisanalhal.v17i1.83-97>
- Barnard, R. W. (2023). Diversity, Equity, Inclusion In My Classroom: Attempting To Bridge The Gap Between Content And Real-Life. *Open Access Library Journal*, 10, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.4236/oalib.1110508>
- Basuni, A., Ma'mur, I., & Kurniawan, A. F. (2021). Freedom To Learn Manifesto Of Ki Hadjar Dewantara's Educational Philosophy: A New Formula In PAI Learning. *International Journal of Nusantara Islam*, 9(2), 548–560. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ijni.v9i2.16871>
- Ben-Amram, M., & Davidovitch, N. (2024). Novice Teachers and Mentor Teachers: From a Traditional Model to a Holistic Mentoring Model in the Postmodern Era. *Education Sciences*, 14(2), 143. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci14020143>
- Bijsmans, P., de Bruin, J., & Groen, A. (2023). 'It's Like Two Different Worlds': The Multifaceted Nature Of Social Support In Students' Transition From High School To A Problem-Based Learning Undergraduate Programme. *European Journal of Higher Education*, 15(1), 149–165. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21568235.2023.2289037>
- Brandisauskiene, A., Buksnyte-Marmiene, L., Cesnaviciene, J., & Jarasiunaite-Fedosejeva, G. (2023). The Relationship Between Teacher's Autonomy-Supportive Behavior and Learning Strategies Applied by Students: The Role of Teacher Support and Equity. *SAGE Open*, 13(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440231181384>

- Buchori, S., Kartadinata, S., Yusuf, S., Ilfiandra, I., Fakhri, N., & Adiputra, S. (2021). Developing a framework peace education for primary school teachers in Indonesia. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 20(8), 227–239. <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.20.8.14>
- Busetto, L., Wick, W., & Gumbinger, C. (2020). How To Use And Assess Qualitative Research Methods. *Neurological Research and Practice*, 2(14). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s42466-020-00059-z>
- Carter, N., Bryant-Lukosius, D., DiCenso, A., Blythe, J., & Neville, A. (2014). The use of Triangulation In Qualitative Research. *Oncology Nursing Forum*, 41(5), 545–547. <https://doi.org/10.1188/14.ONF.545-547>
- Charamut, N. R., Racz, S. J., Wang, M., & De Los Reyes, A. (2022). Integrating multi-informant reports of youth mental health: A construct validation test of Kraemer and colleagues' (2003) Satellite Model. *Frontiers in psychology*, 13, 911629. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.911629>
- Cobia, D. C., & Carney, J. S. (2002). Creating a Culture of Tolerance in Schools: Everyday Actions to Prevent Hate-Motivated Violent Incidents. *Journal of School Violence*, 1(2), 87–103. [https://doi.org/10.1300/J202v01n02\\_06](https://doi.org/10.1300/J202v01n02_06)
- Coombs, H. V. (2022). *Case Study Research Defined [White paper]*. Zenodo. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7604301>
- Crowe, S., Cresswell, K., Robertson, A., Huby, G., Avery, A., & Sheikh, A. (2011). The case study approach. *BMC medical research methodology*, 11, 100. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-11-100>
- Darling-Hammond, L., Flook, L., Cook-Harvey, C., Barron, B., & Osher, D. (2019). Implications for educational practice of the science of learning and development. *Applied Developmental Science*, 24(2), 97–140. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10888691.2018.1537791>
- Deppalanna', I., Darson, D., Monika, M., Haner, H., & Karangan, F. I. Y. (2024). Membangun karakter moderasi beragama melalui pendidikan Agama Kristen dalam Kurikulum Merdeka. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan dan Kearifan Lokal*, 4(5), 503–512. Retrieved from <https://www.jipkl.com/index.php/JIPKL/article/view/156>
- Dianasari, D., Maftuh, B., Syaodih, E., Sapriya, & Gomez, M. A. (2023). Students' conflict resolution skills through social problem-solving and social inquiry models in terms of organization experience. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 8(1), 464–478. <https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v8i1.2893>
- Diehl, K., Görig, T., Jansen, C., Hruby, M. C., Pfahlberg, A. B., & Gefeller, O. (2021). "I've Heard of It, Yes, but I Can't Remember What Exactly It Was"—A Qualitative Study on Awareness, Knowledge, and Use of the UV Index. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(4), 1615. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18041615>
- Erdmann, A., & Potthoff, S. (2023). Decision Criteria for the Ethically Reflected Choice of a Member Check Method in Qualitative Research: A Proposal for Discussion. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 22. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069231177664>
- Fadhli, M. N., & Sirait, S. (2018). Religious Tolerance: Perspective Of Teachers From Different Religions In Elementary Education (SD) Remaja Parakan Temanggung. *Sunan Kalijaga International Journal on Islamic Educational Research*, 2(1), 19–31. <https://doi.org/10.14421/skijier.2018.2018.21.02>
- Fahmi, I. (2025). Moderasi Beragama: Membangun Karakter Siswa Yang Damai Dan Toleran: Konsep Moderasi Beragama, Pentingnya Moderasi Beragama Untuk Karakter Siswa, Strategi Membangun Karakter Siswa Yang Damai Dan Toleran, Tantangan Dalam Implementasi Moderasi Beragama Di Sekolah. *Journal Scientific of Mandalika (JSM)*, 6(3), 579–597. <https://doi.org/10.36312/10.36312/vol6iss3pp579-597>

- Faridah, S., Rahman, S., Putri, M., Majidah, S., & Nulinnaja, R. (2025). Instilling The Values Of Religious Moderation Through Local Culture In Elementary School Students. *JMIE (Journal of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Education)*, 9(1), 1-12. <http://dx.doi.org/10.32934/jmie.v9i1.655>
- Firmansyah, R., Putri, A., & Abidondifu, P. (2024). Mencegah Perbuatan Intoleransi Yang Mengakibatkan Perbuatan Bullying. *Legal Empowerment: Jurnal Pengabdian Hukum*, 2(2), 47–53. <https://doi.org/10.46924/legalempowerment.v2i2.226>
- Fitriani, F., Nurhuda, N., & Ina, A. I. (2021). Improving Students' Activeness And Critical Thinking Skills Through Problem Based Learning. *Journal of Science and Education (JSE)*, 2(1), 19-29. <https://doi.org/10.56003/jse.v2i1.60>
- Gamage, K. A. A., Dehideniya, D. M. S. C. P. K., & Ekanayake, S. Y. (2021). The Role of Personal Values in Learning Approaches and Student Achievements. *Behavioral sciences (Basel, Switzerland)*, 11(7), 102. <https://doi.org/10.3390/bs11070102>
- Ghifari, M., & Masdar, M. (2024). Aswaja Material Learning Assistance with Peer Learning Method. *Communaute: Journal of Community Service*, 3(2), 206–216. <https://doi.org/10.61987/communaute.v3i2.461>
- Gimbert, B. G., Miller, D., Herman, E., Breedlove, M., & Molina, C. E. (2021). Social Emotional Learning in Schools: The Importance of Educator Competence. *Journal of Research on Leadership Education*, 18(1), 3-39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/19427751211014920>
- Gunawan, J., Marzilli, C., & Aungsuroch, Y. (2022). Online 'chatting' interviews: An acceptable method for qualitative data collection. *Belitung Nursing Journal*, 8(4), 277–279. <https://doi.org/10.33546/bnj.2252>
- Hadirman, H. (2024). Implementasi Moderasi Beragama Dan Pembinaan Karakter Di SMA Muhammadiyah Manado. *Transformasi*, 6(2), 1–25. <https://transformasi.kemenag.go.id/index.php/journal/article/view/312>
- Haisraeli, A., & Fogiel-Bijaoui, S. (2021). Parental Involvement In School Pedagogy: A Threat Or A Promise? *Educational Review*, 75(4), 597–616. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131911.2021.1935489>
- Hamid, S. A., Tobroni, & Humaidi, N. (2024). Tolerance of Religious Life Among Elementary School Students. *Didaktika: Jurnal Kependidikan*, 13(001 Des), 1257-1272. <https://doi.org/10.58230/27454312.1456>
- Hasanah, E. U., Suhatmady, B., Asih, Y. U., Kalukar, V. J., Iswari, W. P., & Ping, M. T. (2025). Addressing the Gap in Reflective Teaching Practices: A Case Study of an English Lecturer in Non-English Major. *Borneo Educational Journal (Borju)*, 7(1), 178–192. <https://doi.org/10.24903/bej.v7i1.1975>
- Hermawan, E., & Arifin, A. L. (2021). What Expert Say about Empowering Human Resources in Supporting Leadership Function in Higher Education in the 21st Century. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 6(2), 27–38. <https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v6i2.1493>
- Hikmat, R., Suryani, S., Yosep, I., & Jeharsae, R. (2024). Empathy's Crucial Role: Unraveling Impact on Students Bullying Behavior - A Scoping Review. *Journal of multidisciplinary healthcare*, 17, 3483–3495. <https://doi.org/10.2147/JMDH.S469921>
- Husna, D., 'Aziizah, 'A. U., & Sirait, S. (2023). Implementasi nilai-nilai moderasi beragama dalam program PPI (Peta Pertumbuhan Individu) di MI Ma'had Islamy Yogyakarta. *Evaluasi: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 243–268. <https://doi.org/10.32478/evaluasi.v7i2.1227>
- Husna, U., & Thohir, M. (2020). Religious Moderation As A New Approach To Learning Islamic Religious Education In Schools. *Nadwa*, 14(1), 1999. <https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2020.14.1.5766>
- Hyett, N., Kenny, A., & Dickson-Swift, V. (2014). Methodology Or Method? A Critical Review Of Qualitative Case Study Reports. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-Being*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.3402/qhw.v9.23606>

- INFID (2022). *Sikap Generasi Milenial dan Generasi Z Terhadap Toleransi, Kebinekaan dan Kebebasan Beragama di Indonesia*. <https://infid.org/sikap-generasi-milenial-dan-generasi-z-terhadap-toleransi-kebinekaan-dan-kebebasan-beragama-di-indonesia/>
- Intyaswati, D., Maryani, E., Sugiana, D., & Venus, A. (2021). Social Media as an Information Source of Political Learning in Online Education. *SAGE Open*, 11(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211023181>
- Juhri, M. A. (2024). Revitalisasi Peran Keluarga Tumbuhkan Toleransi Sejak Dini: Teladan Kisah Luqman. *Moderatio: Jurnal Moderasi Beragama*, 4(1), 63–74. <https://doi.org/10.32332/moderatio.v4i1.9053>
- Kapisa, H. A. (2019, Desember). *SD Inpres di Manokwari larang siswi berhijab di kelas*. Tempo.co. <https://nasional.tempo.co/read/1280055/sd-inpres-di-manokwari-larang-siswi-berhijab-di-kelas>
- Kyololo, O. M., Stevens, B. J., & Songok, J. (2023). Photo-Elicitation Technique: Utility and Challenges in Clinical Research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 22. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069231165714>
- Lutfiyani, L., & Ashoumi, H. (2022). Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pembelajaran Aswaja Dan Implementasinya Terhadap Sikap Anti-Radikalisme Mahasiswa. *Dar El-Ilmi: Jurnal Studi Keagamaan, Pendidikan Dan Humaniora*, 9(2), 1-26. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.52166/darelilmi.v9i2.3332>
- Mahrus, M., & Afandi, N. K. (2024). Building Tolerance From An Early Age: Instilling Religious Moderation Values In Elementary Schools. *EDUKASIA: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 5(2), 159–168. <https://doi.org/10.62775/edukasia.v5i2.1168>
- Manandhar, D. N., & Joshi, P. S. K. (2020). Importance Of Consent In The Research. *International Journal of Occupational Safety and Health*, 10(2), 89–91. <https://doi.org/10.3126/ijosh.v10i2.33284>
- Matamoros-Fernández, A., & Farkas, J. (2021). Racism, Hate Speech, and Social Media: A Systematic Review and Critique. *Television & New Media*, 22(2), 205-224. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1527476420982230>
- Mawarti, S. (2018). Fenomena Hate Speech: Dampak Ujaran Kebencian. *Toleransi: Media Komunikasi Umat Beragama*, 10(1), 83–95. <https://doi.org/10.24014/trs.v10i1.5722>
- McIntosh, M. J., & Morse, J. M. (2015). Situating and constructing diversity in semi-structured interviews. *Global Qualitative Nursing Research*, 2, 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2333393615597674>
- Mcleod, S. (2025). *Vygotsky's Theory of Cognitive Development*. Simply Psychology. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.15680745>
- Melisa, K., Lutfia, N., Saptura, A., & Zulkarnain, A. I. (2025). Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama dalam Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam di Madrasah Aliyah. *Journal of Innovative and Creativity*, 5(2), 416–424. <https://doi.org/10.31004/joecy.v5i2.195>
- Minanda, R. (2024). Implementasi Moderasi Beragama Pada Madrasah Dengan Kurikulum Berbasis Neurosains, Berdasarkan Potensi Dan Karakteristik Provinsi Aceh. *COMSERVA: Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat*, 4(3), 645–661. <https://doi.org/10.59141/comserva.v4i3.1342>
- Mtisi, S. (2022). The Qualitative Case Study Research Strategy as Applied on a Rural Enterprise Development Doctoral Research Project. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 21. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069221145849>
- Muhammad, G., Ruswandi, U., Nurmila, N., & Zakiyah, Q. Y. (2023). Implementation of Multicultural Values through the Hidden Curriculum of PAI Subjects in Forming a Peace-loving Character in Junior High Schools. *European Journal of Education and Pedagogy*, 4(6), 113–120. <https://doi.org/10.24018/ejedu.2023.4.6.768>

- Nabila, M., Supriyatno, T., & Maimun, A. (2025). Diane Tillman's Concept in Instilling the Values of Religious Moderation at SMP Negeri 1 Sanggau. *AS-SABIQUN*, 7(4), 655-678. <https://doi.org/10.36088/assabiqun.v7i4.5754>
- Naeem, M., Ozuem, W., Howell, K., & Ranfagni, S. (2023). A Step-by-Step Process of Thematic Analysis to Develop a Conceptual Model in Qualitative Research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 22. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069231205789>
- Natow, R. S. (2019). The Use Of Triangulation In Qualitative Studies Employing Elite Interviews. *Qualitative Research*, 20(2), 160-173. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794119830077>
- Nelson, L. P., & Crow, M. L. (2014). Do Active-Learning Strategies Improve Students' Critical Thinking? *Higher Education Studies*, 4(2), 77-77. <https://doi.org/10.5539/hes.v4n2p77>
- Qafa, A., Sina, Z., & Prendi, L. (2024). The Impact Of Teachers' Attitudes On The Effectiveness Of Teaching With The Student In The Center. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 14(6), 88. <https://doi.org/10.36941/jesr-2024-0158>
- Rahmadini, R., Siregar, T. A. Z., Purba, N. K., Sihotang, R. I., Kamila, N., & Siregar, W. M. (2024). Kesulitan Siswa Sekolah Dasar Dalam Membedakan Antara Suku Dan Agama. *Jurnal Merah Putih Sekolah Dasar*, 1(6), 306-311. <https://doi.org/10.24114/jmpsd.v1i6.62044>
- Rahman, M. T., & Mulyana, M. (2024). Madrasah Teachers' Engagement In Promoting Religious Moderation. *Hanifiya: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama*, 7(1), 15-26. <https://doi.org/10.15575/hanifiya.v7i1.32737>
- Ramirez-Arellano, A. (2024). Effects of Personality and Motivation on Students' Academic Engagement and Metacognitive-Cognitive Strategies. *SAGE Open*, 14(4). <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440241295845>
- Rashid, Y., Rashid, A., Warraich, M. A., Sabir, S. S., & Waseem, A. (2019). Case Study Method: A Step-by-Step Guide for Business Researchers. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 18. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406919862424>
- Ridder, H.-G. (2014). Book Review: Qualitative Data Analysis. A Methods Sourcebook. *German Journal of Human Resource Management*, 28(4), 485-487. <https://doi.org/10.1177/239700221402800402>
- Safuan, A., Fanani, A., Hidayah, F., Mashuri, I., & Baharun, H. (2024). Communication Shapes Students' Character Through The Values Of Ahlussunah Wal Jamaah In Madrasah. *Al-Tsiqoh: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Dakwah Islam*, 9(2), 37-51. <https://doi.org/10.31538/altsiq.v9i2.5547>
- Sakti, S. A., Endraswara, S., & Rohman, A. (2024). Revitalizing Local Wisdom Within Character Education Through Ethnopedagogy Approach: A Case Study On A Preschool In Yogyakarta. *Heliyon*, 10(10), e31370. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e31370>
- SETARA Institute for Democracy and Peace. (2023). *Laporan Survei Toleransi Siswa Sekolah Menengah Atas (SMA)*. <https://setara-institute.org/laporan-survei-toleransi-siswa-sekolah-menengah-atas-sma/>
- Setiawan, R. (2022, Agustus). Kasus Pemaksaan Jilbab Di Sekolah Masif, Kemendikbud Bisa Apa? <https://tirto.id/kasus-pemaksaan-jilbab-di-sekolah-masif-kemendikbud-bisa-apa-guSw>
- Southworth, J. (2022). Bridging Critical Thinking And Transformative Learning: The Role Of Perspective-Taking. *Theory and Research in Education*, 20(1), 44-63. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14778785221090853>
- Sudirman, S., Hidayah, S. I. N., & Agustina, C. D. (2023). Strategi Guru PAI Dalam Menanamkan Konsep Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pembelajaran PAI. *Modeling: Jurnal Program Studi PGMI*, 10(1), 531-542. <https://doi.org/10.69896/modeling.v10i1.2807>

- Suhaemi, A. (2019). Sociological orientation of Islamic education: Perspective of the Quran. *Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies*, 6(2), 91–116. <https://doi.org/10.15408/quhas.v6i2.13413>
- Suprpto, S. (2020). Integrasi Moderasi Beragama Dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan*, 18(3), 355–367. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v18i3.750>
- Suryowati, E. (2017, Mei). Asal Muasal Penelitian Kemendikbud Dan Temuan Sikap Intoleransi Di Sekolah. Kompas.com. <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/05/03/14380761/asal.muasal.penelitian.kemendikbud.dan.temuan.sikap.intoleransi.di.sekolah>
- Sutton, J., & Austin, Z. (2015). Qualitative Research: Data Collection, Analysis, and Management. *The Canadian Journal Of Hospital Pharmacy*, 68(3), 226–231. <https://doi.org/10.4212/cjhp.v68i3.1456>
- Taquette, S. R., & Borges da Matta Souza, L. M. (2022). Ethical Dilemmas in Qualitative Research: A Critical Literature Review. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 21. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069221078731>
- Turner, C., Prasasti, I. H., Baihaqi, Y., & Andewi, W. (2024). The Role Of The Teacher As A Model In Forming Character Education In Primary School Students. *International Journal of Education, Culture and Technology*, 1(1), 47–52. <https://doi.org/10.69747/edu-ij.v1i1.53>
- Verkuyten, M., & Kollar, R. (2021). Tolerance And Intolerance: Cultural Meanings And Discursive Usage. *Culture & Psychology*, 27(1), 172–186. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354067X20984356>
- Veronika, C., & Dafit, F. (2022). The Role of the Teacher in the Character Education Strengthening Program for Grade V Elementary School Students. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar*, 6(2), 331–337. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jisd.v6i2.46342>
- Widiyono, A. (2022). Internalizing Aswaja-Based Character Education Through School Environment Design And Collaborative Strategy. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education Studies (IJIES)*, 5(1), 35–50. <https://doi.org/10.33367/ijies.v5i1.2324>
- Yu, H., Abdullah, A., & Saat, R. M. (2014). Overcoming Time And Ethical Constraints In The Qualitative Data Collection Process: A Case Of Information Literacy Research. *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science*, 46(3), 243–257. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0961000614526610>
- Zurlo, M. C., Vallone, F., Dell'Aquila, E., & Marocco, D. (2020). Teachers' Patterns of Management of Conflicts With Students: A Study in Five European Countries. *Europe's Journal Of Psychology*, 16(1), 112–127. <https://doi.org/10.5964/ejop.v16i1.1955>

